



-

:

:

/

/

/

-

-



جامعة القدس  
عمادة الدراسات العليا  
معهد التنمية المستدامة

## إجازة الرسالة

واقع تطبيق مبادئ الحكم الرشيد في وزارة المالية الفلسطينية وعلاقته بفاعلية الأداء من وجهة نظر الموظفين

إعداد: منور احمد علي الحلبية  
الرقم الجامعي: 20520218

إشراف: الدكتورة فدوى اللبدي

نوقشت هذه الرسالة وأجيزت بتاريخ 28/03/2010م من لجنة المناقشة المدرجة أسماؤهم وتوافقهم:

- 1 رئيس لجنة المناقشة: الدكتورة فدوى اللبدي  
التوقيع: .....
- 2 ممتحنا داخليا: الدكتور عبد الرحمن الحاج  
التوقيع: .....
- 3 ممتحنا خارجيا: الدكتور يوسف أبو فارة  
التوقيع: .....

القدس - فلسطين

1431هـ / 2010



.....:

:

.....:



.

).

(2005

:

:

"

"

)

.(2002

:

.(2003 ) .

:

)

(

.(2003 ) .

:

).

.(1997

:

) .

.(1997

:

"

(2003 ).

:

.

.(2007

)

:

(2001 ).

:

( ).

1237

234



# **The reality of implementing good governance principles at Ministry of Finance, and its relationship with performance efficiency from the staff point of view**

## **Abstract**

This study is designed to recognize implementation reality of good governance principles at Ministry of Finance, and its relationship with performance efficiency from staff viewpoint through implementation of these principles. It also aims at devising recommendations that would increase effectiveness of MOF performance in case those principles were implemented in all MOF programs; so that staff would be able to carry out all tasks to the fullest, since allowances and bonuses positively affect efficiency of employee performance.

Study group included all MOF staff (1237) according to department of administrative affairs. Researcher selected a stratified random sample consists of 234 employees.

Results showed that reality of implementing good governance principles at MOF and its relation with efficiency of operations from staff viewpoint was moderate compared to all study fields. Results also manifested that MOF is trying to prompt and oblige all staff to enforce law, where there is general and comprehensive auditing over MOF accounts (revenues and expenditure). Nevertheless, implementation was interrupted by some drawbacks, as MOF is working to realize transparency principle relatively, and results demonstrated that MOF applies equality principle with various degrees. For example: there is relative equality on basis of gender or place of residence, and equality percentage decreases on levels of political affiliation and academic qualification, together with discrimination in applying penalties, as results were very low for inequality in this respect.

The study came up with several recommendations, the most important of which is that MOF is advised to improve performance regarding achieve of job security, allocation of sufficient programs for citizens' welfare, more adherence to everything that preserves staff rights and equity in staff treatment without discrimination.

Furthermore, staff rights must be realized with regard to MOF interest in measuring staff contentment, setting clear standards for performance assessment, non-delay to pay financial receivables after retirement, providing appropriate environment that urges staff to achieve, more interest in realizing high spirits for all staff through involving them in decision-making process and enabling staff to deliver their complaints to supervisors without obstacles.

In addition, MOF must work further in order to provide all means through which staff suggestions and viewpoints could be submitted to their supervisors



**1.1**

**2.1**

:

)

(

•

•

**3.1**

:

•

•

**4.1**

:

•

•

•

•

•

•

**5.1**

:

: **.1.5.1**

: **.2.5.1**

: **.3.5.1**

**6.1**

:

:

•

:

○  
○  
○  
○  
○

: •

**7.1**

:

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

)

.

( $\alpha \leq (0.05)$ ) : •

)

$(\alpha \leq (0.05))$  : •  
 )  
 $(\alpha \leq (0.05))$  : •  
 )  
 $(\alpha \leq (0.05))$  : •  
 )  
 $\leq (0.05)$  : •  
 )  $(\alpha$   
 $(\alpha \leq (0.05))$  : •  
 )

**8.1**

/ : •  
 (2009-12-15 ) (2008-9-15) : •  
 : •



**1.2**

**2.2**

: **.1.2.2**

.1994

1967

1994

) .1994 ( )

.(1999

.(1999 ) . %4-3.5

:

) .

.(1999

1999 / .

2002 .(1999 ) .

:

.2002

2005 2004 2003

"

"

1998

2003

2006

2004 2003

2006

(2006 ) .

:

**.2.2.2**

1998 7

(2006 ) .

70

:

•

" :

"

"

60

:

•

:

:

"

" : (8)

"

(2006 ) .

" " 3.2

: .13.2

: -( ) - :

" " ( )  
(2000 ) .

: .2.3.2

: 2002

(2002 ) .

(2007 )

)

: (2002:101

1997

:

"Micro"

: ( )

4.2

"The nature of the firm "

1937

."Ronald Coase "

:

.(2006 )

" "

(charge de

"

( 1978 )

gouvernance1679)

" "

.(2005 ) .

5.2

:

.(2003 ) .

( 2007 )

(2003 )

) . ( ) ( )

.(2003

( 2007 )

(2007 ) .

(2004 ) .

( 2005 ) .

(2007 ) .(2003 )

( )  
(2004 ) .

( 2007 ) .

.(2003 )

( 2007 )

(2004 ) .

(2003 ) .

:

(2005 ) .(2004 ) .

(2007 )

) .

( 2007

( 2007 ) .(2003 ) .

(2004 )

.( 2007 )

(2004 )

( 2007 ) .

.(2003 )

( 2007 )

(

(2004 ) .

"

"

:

.( )

( )

( )

**6.2**

.( 2007 ) .

.(2004 ) .

( ) **7.2**

) .

( 2007

( )

**8.2**

(2008 )

:

- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
-

•

•

•

(2007 )

**9.2**

: **.1.9.2**

(2001 )

(1983 )

: **.2.9.2**

: •

) : •

: •

(2003 ) .

: **.3.9.2**

)

.(

(2005 ) .

: **.4.9.2**

:

•  
•

(2005 )

- 
- 

:

:

- 

)

:

- 

(

:

- 

:

- 

:

- 

:

- 

:

- 

:

- 
- 
-

: •

(2005 ).

: **.5.9.2**

: (2009 )

" "

" : ( )

Substantive rationality

) .

: .(2002

(2009 )

(2009 )

**10.2**

**.1.10.2**

(2003 )

1967

.1998

(2003 )

(2004 )

:(2007 )

(2008 )

260

( 2009 )

(30)

) ( : )  
( )  
(

**2.10.2**

(2004 )

populism

(2008 )

:

(1998)

:

:

:

(2005 )

28 56

(2007-2006)

:

( 2008 )

113

"

(1999- )"

2005-1999

114

:

**11.2**

•

•



**1.3**

(2001 )

: **2.3**

( 1237)

. 26.4 73.6

3.3

6 240 :  
. % 18.9 . (234)

4.3

.(2.3 1.3) .(7.3 1.3)

:1.3

70.9	166	
29.1	68	
<b>%100</b>	<b>234</b>	

:2.3

12.0	28	24-20
26.5	62	29-25
23.9	56	34-30
12.0	28	39-35
25.6	60	40
<b>%100</b>	<b>234</b>	

, (1.3)

%29.1 %70.9  
%73.6 %26.4



: :5.3

18.8	44	
68.4	160	
12.8	30	
%100	234	

(6.3)

%29.9

%70.1

:6.3

70.1	164	
29.9	70	
%100	234	

(7.3)

%27.4

%2.6

%39.3

%30.8

:7.3

2.6	6	
27.4	64	
30.8	72	
39.3	92	
%100	234	

**5.3**

( )  
7 (1.3)

:  
(5)  
(8.3)

" " :8.3

		#
24	:	1
19	:	2
15	:	3
10	:	4
9	:	5
28	:	6

**6.3**

**7.3**

(0.9802)

:

: 9.3

	:
0.9059	.
0.9235	.
0.9161	.
0.9389	.
0.9118	.
0.9716	.
0.9591	.
0.9802	.

: **8.3**

**9.3**

: **.1.9.3**

.( , ) : •  
 34-30 29-25 24-20 ) : •  
 .( 40 39-35  
 .( \ ) : •  
 11 10-5 5 ) : •  
 .( ) : •

( ) : •  
( ) : •  
: **2.9.3**  
:  
:  
•  
•  
•  
•  
•  
: **.3.9.3**

---

4.1

: 2.4

:

2.60-1	
3.40-2.61	
5-3.41	

: 1.2.4

:

: 1.1.2.4

:

: -1.4

:

1.145	3.10		1
0.985	3.46		2
1.017	3.42		3
1.027	3.56		4
1.030	3.62		5
1.025	3.58		6
0.927	3.40		7
0.984	3.04		8
0.941	3.18		9
0.983	3.30		10
0.959	3.09		11
0.966	3.04		12
0.965	3.30		13
1.010	3.26		14
1.023	3.25		15
1.118	2.95		16

: -1.4

:

1.156	2.75	.	17
1.073	2.29	.	18
1.072	2.98	.	19
0.989	3.00	.	20
0.933	2.93	.	21
1.009	2.94	.	22
0.968	2.91	.	23
4.221	3.25	.	24
0.7395	3.1503		

(1.4)

:

(3.1503)

(3.58-2.29)

(3.10)

(3.42) (3.46)

(2.75)

(2.29)

(2.95)

(24) (23) (15) (10) (7)

) ( )

(3.56)

(6) (5)

(

(3.58)

(3.62)

-(3.4)

(20) (13) (12) (11) (9) (8)

(3.30)

(3.26)

(2.98)

(2.94)

(2.93)

:

**.2.1.2.4**

:

: -2.4

:

0.900	3.26		25
0.864	3.31	( ) ( )	26
0.973	3.34		27
1.010	3.23		28
1.127	3.03		29
1.188	2.74		30
1.103	2.68	( )	31
1.045	2.49	( )	32
1.002	2.13		33
1.146	2.46	( )	34
1.109	2.52		35
1.080	2.39		36
1.244	3.22		37
0.973	2.78		38
0.931	2.79		39
0.989	2.91		40
1.029	3.38		41
1.061	3.27	( )	42
0.998	3.02		43
1.029	2.68		44
<b>0.6665</b>	<b>2.8816</b>		

(2.4)

:

(2.8816)

(3.38-2.13)

(3.26)

(3.31) ( ) ( )

(3.34)

(3.03)

(3.23)

( )

(2.74)

( )

(2.68)

(2.13)

( )

(2.46)

(2.39 )

(2.52)

(2.78)

(3.22)

(2.91)

(2.79)

(3.38)

(3.27) ( )

(3.02)

(2.68)

:

**.3.1.2.4**

:

: -3.4

:

1.101	2.76		45
1.016	2.88		46
0.994	2.63		47
0.983	2.83		48

:

0.960	2.62		49
1.085	2.79		50
1.055	2.68		51
1.068	2.45		52
1.060	2.56		53
1.076	2.64		54
0.966	2.65		55
0.967	2.69		56
1.067	2.65		57
1.121	3.58		58
1.128	3.59		59
<b>0.7084</b>	<b>2.80</b>		

(3.4)

:

(2.80)

(3.59-2.45)

(2.76)

(2.88)

(2.62)

(2.68)

(2.64)

(2.63)

(2.83)

(2.79)

(2.45)

(2.56)

(2.65)

(2.69)

(2.65)

(3.58)

(3.59)

:

**.4.1.2.4**

:

:4.4

1.254	2.87	.	60
1.117	2.49	.	61
1.212	2.54		62
1.053	2.27		63
1.048	1.98	.	64
1.040	2.00		65
1.003	2.09	.( )	66
1.035	2.23	.	67
0.964	2.08	.	68
0.985	2.03		69
1.077	2.18	.	70
0.8468	2.2502		

(4.4)

:

(2.2502)

(2.87 - 1.98)

(2.87)

(2.49)

(2.54)

(2.27)

(1.98)

(2.00)

(2.09).( )

(2.23)

(2.03)

( 2.08)

(2.18)

:

**.5.1.2.4**

)

:

:5.4

:

0.944	2.14	.( )	71
0.932	2.32		72
1.180	2.59		73
1.035	2.44		74
0.968	2.48		75
0.982	2.26		76
0.975	2.10		77
0.938	2.06		78
1.061	2.52		79
0.7693	2.3229		

(5.4)

:

(2.3229)

(2.59 -2.06)

:

(2.14)

○

○

(2.32)

●

●

(2.59)

(2.44) •  
 (2.48) •  
 (2.26) •  
 (2.10) •  
 (2.06) •  
 (2.52) •

**.6.1.2.4**

:

(2.2502 – 3.1503)

:

(3.1503 )

:

(07395)

(0.6665)

(2.8816)

(0.7084)

(2.8006)

(2.3229)

(2.2502)

(0.7693)

(0.8468)

:6.4

0.7395	3.1503	1		1
0.6665	2.8816	2		2
0.7084	2.8006	3		3
0.8468	2.2502	5		4
0.769413	2.3229	4		5
0.7461	2.68112			

:

.2.2.4

:

: -7.4

:

0.873	3.26		80
0.858	3.05	)	81
		(	
0.898	2.98		82
0.966	3.10		83
0.897	3.05		84
0.834	3.01		85
0.893	2.97		86
0.985	2.87		87

: -7.4

:

1.035	2.56		88
0.913	2.54	)	89
0.952	2.79	(	90
0.955	2.66		91
0.887	2.89		92
0.990	2.60		93
1.043	2.44		94
1.060	2.96		95
0.995	2.24		96
1.101	2.53		97
1.076	2.69		98
0.971	2.75		99
0.968	2.91		100
0.938	3.20	(.. )	101
0.877	3.21		102
0.889	3.29		103
0.992	2.83		104
1.000	2.58	( )	105
1.046	2.62		106
1.065	2.40		107
1.059	2.17		108
0.6613	2.7990		

( 3.29-2.17)

(2.7990)

(3.26,3.05,2.69,2.87)

(3.10-2.98)

(3.01-3.05)

.(2.97)

(2.56)

(2.54)

:

.(2.79)

.(2.60)

.(2.53)

(2.75)

(2.58)

(2.40)

.(2.17)

- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
-

o

(2.44)

(2.89-2.66)

(.2.96)

(2.24)

(.2.91)

(3.29-3.21-3.20)

(2.62-2.83)

(.2.7990)

**3.4**

5

: **.1.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

) :8.4  
(

	( )	
0.000	0.68	

(0.68) (8.4) (0.000)

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

: **2.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

) :9.4  
(

	( )	
0.000	0.735	

(0.735) (9.4) (0.000)

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

: **3.3.4**

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

) :10.4

	( )	
0.000	0.732	

(0.732)

(10.4)

(0.000)

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

: **4.3.4**

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

) :11.4

:

	( )	
0.000	0.705	

(0.705)

(11.4)

(0.000)

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

: **.5.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

) :12.4

:

	( )	
0.000	0.781	

(0.781)

(12.4)

(0.000)

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

: **.6.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

)

(

(0.062)

" "

(0.308)

(0.258)

(0.381)

(0.099)

(0.133)

( )

(13.4)

) : -13.4

:(

	"t"					
0.062	1.885	0.65437	3.0843	166		
		0.90025	3.3113	68		
0.258	1.135	0.63594	2.8500	166		
		0.73520	2.9588	68		

) : -13.4  
:(

	"t"					
0.308	1.022	0.66166	2.7703	166		
		0.81214	2.8745	68		
0.381	0.878	0.77979	2.2191	166		
		0.99415	2.3262	68		
0.133	1.509	0.75653	2.2744	166		
		0.79314	2.4412	68		
0.099	1.656	0.58348	2.7526	166		
		0.73138	2.9028	68		

: **7.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

)

(

(0.001)

(0.131)

(0.013)

(0.013)

(0.196)

(0.005)

)

24-20

(

)

: -14.4

:

1.07549	3.6577	28	24-20	
0.67641	3.0309	62	29-25	
0.68697	3.2188	56	34-30	
0.69854	2.9494	28	39-35	
0.57137	3.0667	60	40	
0.73955	3.1503	234		
0.77398	3.1143	28	24-20	
0.62292	2.7871	62	29-25	
0.73502	2.9786	56	34-30	
0.60975	2.7571	28	39-35	
0.59342	2.8383	60	40	
0.66654	2.8816	234		
0.93737	3.1952	28	24-20	
0.65550	2.7269	62	29-25	
0.72060	2.8690	56	34-30	
0.58898	2.7238	28	39-35	
0.62237	2.6644	60	40	
0.70847	2.8006	234		
1.19453	2.7532	28	24-20	
0.74203	2.0909	62	29-25	( )
0.89459	2.1786	56	34-30	
0.61409	2.2727	28	39-35	
0.73440	2.2364	60	40	
0.84687	2.2502	234		
0.88874	2.6508	28	24-20	
0.63937	2.2509	62	29-25	
0.79983	2.2778	56	34-30	
0.71104	2.2540	28	39-35	
0.81559	2.3185	60	40	
0.76938	2.3229	234		

) : -14.4  
:

0.81593	3.1917	28	24-20	
0.54564	2.6917	62	29-25	
0.65358	2.8395	56	34-30	
0.59694	2.6844	28	39-35	
0.55371	2.7316	60	40	
0.63212	2.7963	234		

: :15.4

	<b>"F"</b>					
0.001	4.825	2.476	4	9.906		
		0.513	229	117.532		
			233	127.437		
0.131	1.792	0.786	4	3.142		
		0.438	229	100.374		
			233	103.516		
0.013	3.225	1.559	4	6.237		
		0.483	229	110.714		
			233	116.951		
0.013	3.248	2.243	4	8.972		( )
		0.691	229	158.133		
			233	167.104		
0.196	1.526	0.895	4	3.580		
		0.587	229	134.345		
			233	137.925		
0.005	3.776	1.440	4	5.761		
		0.381	229	87.341		
			233	93.102		

: **8.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

)

(

" "

(0.364)

(0.067)

(0.082)

(0.231)

(0.109)

(0.84)

(

)

)

: -16.4

:

	"t"					
0.067	1.838	0.94779	3.3157	52		
		0.66397	3.1030	182		
0.364	0.909	0.68518	2.9558	52		
		0.66151	2.8604	182		
0.082	1.747	0.82268	2.9513	52		
		0.66862	2.7575	182		
0.109	1.607	1.11796	2.4161	52		
		0.74893	2.2028	182		( )
0.231	1.202	0.92042	2.4359	52		
		0.72013	2.2906	182		
0.084	1.736	0.75275	2.9299	52		
		0.59002	2.7581	182		

**.9.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

)

(

(0.053)

(0.323)

(0.501)

(0.001)

(0.123)

(0.339)

(

10-5

)

: -17.4

:(

0.90776	3.3152	78	5	
0.68687	3.0808	66	10-5	
0.58175	3.0583	90	11	
0.73955	3.1503	234		
0.69645	2.9218	78	5	
0.75183	2.9227	66	10-5	
0.56895	2.8167	90	11	
0.66654	2.8816	234		
0.79346	2.8991	78	5	
0.72367	2.7475	66	10-5	
0.61163	2.7541	90	11	
0.70847	2.8006	234		

) : -17.4  
:(

0.98076	2.4522	78	5	( )
0.71212	1.9229	66	10-5	
0.74533	2.3152	90	11	
0.84687	2.2502	234		
0.71384	2.4274	78	5	
0.80978	2.2795	66	10-5	
0.78454	2.2642	90	11	
0.76938	2.3229	234		
0.70269	2.9153	78	5	
0.65275	2.7250	66	10-5	
0.53751	2.7454	90	11	
0.63212	2.7963	234		

: : -18.4

	<b>"F"</b>					
0.053	2.975	1.600	2	3.200		
		0.538	231	124.237		
			233	127.437		
0.501	693.	0.309	2	617.		
		0.445	231	102.899		
			233	103.516		
0.323	1.135	0.569	2	1.139		
		0.501	231	115.812		
			233	116.951		
0.001	7.850	5.317	2	10.635		( )
		0.677	231	156.470		
			233	167.104		

:

: -18.4

	<b>"F"</b>					
0.339	1.087	0643	2	1.286		
		0.592	231	136.639		
			233	137.925		
0.123	2.113	0.837	2	1.673		
		0.396	231	91.429		
			233	93.102		

: **10.3.4**

(  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  )

)

(

(0.460)

(0.290)

(0.183)

(0.094)

(0.312)

(0.927)

(

)

)

: -19.4

:(

0,70318	3.2689	44		
0.78683	3.1323	160		
0.48726	3.0722	30		

) : -19.4

:(

0.73955	3.1503	234		
0.58197	3.0341	44		
0.69813	2.8306	160		
0.58569	2.9300	30		
0.66654	2.8816	234		
0.60613	2.9455	44		
0.74426	2.7567	160		
0.63880	2.8222	30		
0.70847	2.8006	234		
0.76434	2.3719	44		( )
0.86214	2.1716	160		
0.83919	2.4909	30		
0.84687	2.2502	234		
0.70695	2.3636	44		
0.77022	2.3125	160		
0.87135	2.3185	30		
0.76938	2.3229	234		
0.55024	2.9200	44		
0.66904	2.7574	160		
0.52448	2.8219	30		
0.63212	2.7963	234		

: -20.4

:

	<b>"F"</b>					
0.460	0.779	0.427	2	0.854		
		0.548	231	126.583		
			233	127.437		

: -20.4

:

	"F"					
0.183	1.709	0.755	2	1.509		
		0.442	231	102.007		
			233	103.516		
0.290	1.244	0.623	2	1.246		
		0.501	231	115.705		
			233	116.951		
0.094	2.383	1.689	2	3.379		
		0.709	231	163.726		
			233	167.104		
0.927	0.076	0.045	2	0.091		
		0.597	231	137.834		
			233	137.925		
0.312	1.172	0.467	2	0.935		
		0.399	231	92.167		
			233	93.102		

: **.11.3.4**

$\alpha$  ) )  $\leq 0.05$

( (

(0.838)

" "

(0.349)

(0.185)

(0.845)

(0.359)

(0.872)

) :21.4  
(

	"t"				
0.838	0.205	0.7256	3.1438		
		0.7763	3.1655		
0.349	0.939	0.6316	2.8549		
		0.7432	2.9443		
0.845	0.196	0.6800	2.8065		
		0.7761	2.7867		
0.185	1.33	0.8550	2.2982		( )
		0.8226	2.1377		
0.359	0.919	0.7773	2.2927		
		0.7511	2.3937		
0.872	0.161	0.6161	2.7919		
		0.67272	2.8065		

: **.12.3.4**

( $\alpha$ ) )  
 )  $\leq 0.05$   
 ( )  
 (0.00) (0.00)  
 (0.03) (0.00)  
 (0.00) (0.00)  
 (0.00)

( )

)

:22.4

:(

0.49301	3.5833	6		
0.54877	3.0625	64		
0.64157	2.8924	72		
0.85517	3.3850	92		
0.73955	3.1503	234		
0.67132	3.7167	6		
0.48745	2.9781	64		
0.68356	2.6583	72		
0.69920	2.9348	92		
0.66654	2.8816	234		
1.08211	2.9778	6		
0.58311	2.9292	64		
0.64730	2.5056	72		
0.74761	2.9304	92		
0.70847	2.8006	234		
0.72271	3.0000	6		
0.74438	2.3210	64		( )
0.74898	1.9823	72		
0.93616	2.3617	92		
0.84687	2.2502	234		
0.82751	3.2963	6		
0.83029	2.4410	64		
0.67708	2.0247	72		
0.70191	2.4106	92		
0.76938	2.3229	234		
0.70244	3.3882	6		

0.51944	2.8418	64		
0.58454	2.5341	72		
0.66727	2.9312	92		
0.63212	2.7963	234		

:23.4

:

	"F"					
0.000	7.587	3.825	3	11.475		
		0.504	230	115.962		
			233	127.437		
0.000	6.973	2.877	3	8.630		
		0.413	230	94.886		
			233	103.516		
0.000	6.442	3.022	3	9.065		
		0.469	230	107.886		
			233	116.951		
0.003	4.882	3.335	3	10.004		
		0.683	230	157.101		
			233	167.104		
0.000	8.447	4.563	3	13.688		
		0.540	230	124.237		
			233	137.925		
0.000	8.062	2.953	3	8.858		
		0.366	230	84.243		
			233	93.102		



**1.5**

" :

**.1.1.5**

:

(1.4)

•

(3.1503)

(0.7395)

(5) (1.4)

(18)

•

(2003 )

•

:

(2.4)

•

(2.8816)

(0.6665)

(5)

(2.4)

(15)

( ) ( )

•

•

( )

•

:

(3.4)

•

(2.80)

(0.7084)

(11)

(2) (3.4)

(2)

.

:

(4.4)

•

(2.2502)

(0.8468)

(4.4)

(10)

•

•

( )

•

:

(5.4)

•

(2.3229)

(0.7693)

(5.4)

(9)

•

: **.2.1.5**

(7.4) •

(2.7990)

(0.6613)

(20)

(7.4)

(9)

•

: **3.5**

:  
( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

$\leq (0.05)$

:

$(\alpha$

•

( )

:

( )

24-20

•

(a  $\leq 0.05$ )

:

)

(

•

( )

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

)

(

(

10-5

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

)

(

:

( $\alpha \leq 0.05$ )

( )

( )

( a )

:

$\leq 0.05$

( )

( )

: 3.5

:

:

(1.4)

:

o

○  
○  
○  
○

(2.4)

●

:

○  
○  
○

○

○

○

○

: (3.4)

●

○

○

○

○

○

○

(5.4)

•

- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 

•

:

(7.4)

- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 
-

○

4.5

●

●

●

●

●

●

●

●

•

•

4.5

:

•

•

•

•

•

•

•

( )

•

•

•

•

- (2006) •
- (2008) •
- (2006) •
- .27
- (2002) •
- :(1997) •
- (2007) •
- . 2005-1985
- (2005) •
- (2006) •
- (2003) •
- ( )
- (2001) •
- (2007 ) •
- (2007) •
- (2003) •
- (2003) •

2

	(2004)	•
	(2004)	•
	(2002)	•
	(1999)	•
	(1983)	•
	(2005 )	•
(2005)		•
	.4 27	
	(2009)	•
	(2009)	•
	(2000)	•
256 23	(2005 )	•
	(2003)	•
11	(2004)	•
		309

(2007) •

(2005) •

11

(2007) •

( )

(2005) •

(2001) •

(2005) •

Joner, M.(2008): an analysis of the effect of governance and government spending on primary school enrollment, Claremont, California.

Wormach, J, (2008): A comparison of the governance practices of community collage trustees at designated and nono-designated entrepreneurial community colleges, morgan state university.



:1.3



.....

.....

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

-

(2 □) (1 □)

:

-

29-25 (3 □)    34-30 (2 □)    24-20 (1 □)

39-35 (4 □)    40 (5 □)

:

-

/ (3 □)    (2 □)    (1 □)

:

-

10-5 (3 □)    5 (1 □)

:

-

11 (2 □)

:

-

(2 □) (1 □)

:

-

(3 □)

:

-

(2 □) (1 □)

:

-

(4 □)    (3 □)    (2 □)    (1 □)

:

:

:

:

:

:

						1
						2
						3

						4
						5
						6
						7
						8
						9
						10
						11
						12
						13
						14
						15
						16
						17
						18
						19
						20
						21
						22
						23
						24

: :

					.	25
					( )	26
					.( )	
					.	27
					.	28
					.	29
					.	30
					( )	31
					( )	32
					.	33
					)	34
					(	35
					.	36
					.	37
					.	38
					.	39
					.	40
					.	41
					( )	42
					.	43

						44
--	--	--	--	--	--	----

:

						45
						46
						47
						48
						49
						50
						51
						52
						53
						54
						55
						56
						57
						58
						59

:

						60
						61
						62
						63
						64
						65
					)	66
						67
						68
						69
						70

: :

					.( )	71
						72
						73
						74
						75
						76
						77
						78
						79

: :

						80
					)	81
					(	82
						83
						84
						85
						86
						87

						88
						89
					.( )	
						90
						91
						92
						93
						94
						95
						96
						97
						98
						99
						100
						101
					(.. )	
						102
						103
						104
						105
					( )	
						106

						107
						108

		.
		.
		.
		.
		.
		.
		.

: (Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.00	0.603		1
0.00	0.620		2
0.00	0.679		3
0.00	0.647		4
0.00	0.644		5
0.00	0.683		6
0.00	0.659		7
0.00	0.716		8
0.00	0.694		9
0.00	0.718		10
0.00	0.713		11
0.00	0.681		12
0.00	0.619		13
0.00	0.652		14
0.00	0.766		15
0.00	0.757		16
0.00	0.658		17
0.00	0.672		18
0.00	0.711		19
0.00	0.582		20
0.00	0.609		21
0.00	0.710		22

0.00	0.572		23
0.00	0.514		24

(Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.000	0.589		25
0.000	0.632	( ) ( )	26
0.000	0.599		27
0.000	0.678		28
0.000	0.711		29
0.000	0.705		30
0.000	0.625	( )	31
0.000	0.619	( )	32
0.000	0.751		33
0.000	0.730	( )	34
0.000	0.687		35
0.000	0.683		36
0.000	0.629		37
0.000	0.607		38
0.000	0.642		39
0.000	0.626		40
0.000	0.561		41
0.000	0.599	( )	42

0.000	0.615		43
0.000	0.495		44

(Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.000	0.753		45
0.000	0.751		46
0.000	0.672		47
0.000	0.731		48
0.000	0.766		49
0.000	0.763		50
0.000	0.755		51
0.000	0.667		52
0.000	0.669		53
0.000	0.760		54
0.000	0.745		55
0.000	0.796		56
0.000	0.696		57
0.000	0.389		58
0.000	0.337		59

(Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.000	0.625		60
0.000	0.718		61
0.000	0.725		62
0.000	0.870		63
0.000	0.899		64
0.000	0.837		65
0.000	0.827	.( )	66
0.000	0.797		67
0.000	0.818		68
0.000	0.831		69
0.000	0.800		70

(Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.000	0.762	.( )	71
0.000	0.805		72
0.000	0.588		73
0.000	0.734		74
0.000	0.802		75

0.000	0.805		76
0.000	0.832		77
0.000	0.861		78
0.000	0.768		79

(Pearson Correlation)

	<b>R</b>		
0.000	0.636		80
0.000	0.656	)	81
0.000	0.681	(	82
0.000	0.622		83
0.000	0.682		84
0.000	0.675		85
0.000	0.647		86
0.000	0.714		87
0.000	.676		88
0.000	0.708	)	89
0.000	0.656	.(	90
0.000	0.730		91
0.000	0.629		92
0.000	0.774		93
0.000	0.772		94
0.000	0.590		95
0.000	0.694		96
0.000	0.693		97
0.000	0.730		98
0.000	0.767		99

0.000	0.721		100
0.000	0.610	(.. )	101
0.000	0.528		102
0.000	0.466		103
0.000	0.702		104
0.000	0.737	( )	105
0.000	0.755		106
0.000	0.787		107
0.000	0.736		108

87	.....	1.2
88	.....	1.3
97	.....	2.3
99	.....	3.3

31	.....	1.3
31	.....	2.3
32	.....	3.3
32	.....	4.3
33	.....	5.3
33	.....	6.3
33	.....	7.3
34	....." "	8.3
35	.....	9.3
38	.....	1.4
41	.....	2.4
43	.....	3.4
46	.....	4.4
48	.....	5.4
50	.....	6.4
50	.....	7.4
54	.....)	8.4
54	.....(	9.4
	.....(	

55	)	10.4
	.....(	
56	)	11.4
	.....(	
56	)	12.4
	.....(	
57	)	13.4
	.....(	
59	)	14.4
	.....	
60		15.4
	.....	
61	)	16.4
	.....	
62	)	17.4
	.....	
63		18.4
	.....	
64	)	19.4
	.....	
65		20.4
	.....	
67	)	21.4
	.....	
68	)	22.4
	.....	
69		23.4
	.....	

:

.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....

1 ..... :

1	.....	1.1
2	.....	2.1
3	.....	3.1
3	.....	4.1
3	.....	5.1
4	.....:	1.5.1
4	.....	2.5.1
4	.....	3.5.1
4	.....	6.1
5	.....	7.1
6	.....	8.1

7 ..... :

7	.....	1.2
---	-------	-----

7	.....	2.2
8	.....	1.2.2
9	.....	2.2.2
11	..... "	3.2
11	.....	1.3.2
11	.....	2.3.2
13	.....	4.2
13	.....	5.2
18	..... ( )	6.2
19	.....( )	7.2
20	.....( )	8.2
21	.....	9.2
21	.....	1.9.2
22	.....	2.9.2
22	.....	3.9.2
22	.....	4.9.2
24	.....	5.9.2
25	.....	2.10
25	.....	1.10.2
27	.....	2.10.2
29	.....	10.2
<b>30</b>	..... :	
30	.....	1.3
30	.....	2.3
31	.....	3.3
31	.....	4.3
34	.....	5.3

34	.....	6.3
34	.....	7.3
35	.....	8.3
35	.....	9.3
35	.....	1.9.3
36	.....	2.9.3
36	.....	2.9.3
<b>37</b>	..... :	
37	.....	4.1
37	.....	2.4
38	.....	1.2.4
38	.....	1.1.2.4
40	.....	2.1.2.4
43	.....	3.1.2.4
45	.....	4.1.2.4
47	.....	5.1.2.4
49	.....	.6.1.2.4
50	.....	2.2.4
53	.....	3.4
53	.....	1.3.4
54	.....	2.3.4
55	.....	3.3.4
55	.....	4.3.4
56	.....	5.3.4
57	.....	6.3.4

58	.....	7.3.4
61	.....	8.3.4
62	.....	9.3.4
64	.....	10.3.4
66	.....	11.3.4
67	.....	12.3.4
<b>70</b>	..... :	
70	.....	1.5
75	.....	3.5
78	.....	3.5
81	.....	4.5
82	.....	4.5
<b>84</b>	.....	
<b>104</b>	.....	
<b>105</b>	.....	
<b>107</b>	.....	