Evaluation of Medical Internship Program at the
Ministry of Health in Gaza

Ahmed Salah Al Shorafa

MPH thesis

Jerusalem – Palestine

1441-2019
Evaluation of Medical Internship Program at the Ministry of Health in Gaza

Prepared by:

Ahmed Salah Al Shorafa

B.Sc. Physiotherapy – October 6 University-Cairo, Egypt

Supervisor: Dr. Khamis Elessi

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of Requirements for the Degree of Master of Public Health/Management branch School of Public Health- Al-Quds University

1441/2019
Al-Quds University
Deanship of Graduate Studies
School of Public Health

Thesis Approval

Evaluation of Medical Internship Program at the Ministry of Health in Gaza

Prepared by: Ahmed Salah Al Shorafa

Registration No.: 21611003

Supervisor: Dr. Khamis Elessi

Master thesis submitted and accepted. Date: 
The names of signatures of the examining committee members are as follows:

1. Head of the committee: Dr. Khamis Elessi
2. Internal examiner: Prof. Dr. Yehia Abed
3. External examiner: Dr. Kaled Zimmo

Jerusalem – Palestine

1441 / 2019
Dedication

I dedicate this work to the sake of Allah my Creator and my master.

To my parents whose affection, love, encouragement and prays day and night make me able to get such success and honor.

To my dear wife, for her understanding and support.

To my children, Mohammed, Sarah, Zeina, and Yousef.

To my brothers, sisters and my friends.

To everyone who contributed to getting this study a reality, thank you.

Ahmed Salah Al Shorafa
Declaration

I certify that this thesis submitted for the master's degree is the result of my own research, except where otherwise acknowledged, and that this thesis or any of its parts has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

Signed:

Ahmed Al Shorafa

Date: / /
Acknowledgment

First and foremost, I thank Allah for helping me every moment and during my study. There are no clear words to express my appreciation for Dr. Yehia Abed, Dr. Bassam Abu Hamad, and Dr. Khitam Abu Hamad for their patience, care, inspiration, education, guidance, and endless support.

I would like to express my sincere thanks and appreciation to my supervisor, Dr. Khamis Elessi for his continuous guidance and support.

- Deep appreciation to my family for their motivation and support in my professional life
- I am grateful for my colleagues in the general directorate of human resources development for their help and support.
- I am grateful for my colleagues and friends in the school of public health for their help and support.
- Many thanks go to the experts who helped me in reviewing and revising the questionnaire.
- Deep thanks to all intern doctors who participated in the study because without them this work could not be accomplished.
Abstract

Background: Medical knowledge and methods of treating disease are expanding rapidly. High-quality education and training of healthcare providers are essential contributors to keep up with such development. Medical Internship refers to the supervised training program that lasts for twelve months in an accredited facility, where newly qualified doctors rotate in different medical domains before they’re allowed to provide clinical service to patients as medical practitioners.

Aim: To evaluate the Medical Internship program on Gaza to provide recommendations that contribute to improve the Medical Internship program which could be reflected on the health care system and medical practice.

Methods: descriptive-analytical, cross-sectional design were used. The study population included all intern doctors who finished medical internship program in the period between 2017-2018. We utilized a triangulated approach employing both quantitative and qualitative tools.

Quantitative data was collected through an online self-administered questionnaire. qualitative data were conducted within six focus group discussions with 50 participants from different training centers using a semi-structured interview questionnaire and five Key informant interviews. The response rate was 88.7% (285/335). The overall reliability was high (Chronbach's alpha=0.961). Data was entered and analyzed using the SPSS program version 23 for the quantitative data. open thematic techniques were used to analyze the qualitative data.

Result: The overall weighted mean for the study dimensions was (66.44%). The effects of training program domain (78.52%), the design (66.48%), the environment (66.17%), and the content of training domain (62.46%), while the lowest weighted mean was the role of the general directorate of human resource development (58.77%). males represent 53.3% of study participants, (25.7±1.9). The majority of the participants were graduates from local universities (66.3%), (29.1%) from Arab countries and (4.6%) from other countries.

There are statistically significant differences between the domain of the content of the environment, the effect of the training program, and the governorate, Rafah score the highest mean. There was no statistically significant difference between the other domains. There are statistically significant differences between all domains except the effect of the training program domain, and the place of graduation, (P<0.05). However, no statistically significant differences were observed between the rest of the socio-demographic variables and training program in all domains. Most of participants who received part of the internship period outside Gaza evaluated the training program as an average 43.4%. 33.3% and 23.3% as strong and weak respectively.

Gaps are facing the medical internship program in Gaza, such as guide booklet, orientation programs, field supervision in the training centers, and evaluation tools. Also, there is a need for more focus on clinical skills rather than theoretical skills. An important topic such as the medicolegal aspects, documentation, patient safety and infection control need to be included in the content of the program. There is no suitable place for trainees in the training centers that negatively affect the training environment. Additional challenges facing the intern's doctors is the lack of cooperation between medical staff, overcrowded trainees in some of the training centers, lack of supervision, workload, and absence of clear job description.

Conclusion: The medical internship program shown to be deficient with gaps in many aspects such as orientation, guide booklet, evaluation tools, practical courses and supervision which need improvement to be optimal. The policymakers should pay more attention and efforts in the development and monitoring of the internship program.
# Table of Contents

Dedication ................................................................................................................................. iv
Declaration ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgment .................................................................................................................... ii
Abstract ................................................................................................................................... iii
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................... iv
List of tables ............................................................................................................................. viii
List of Figures .......................................................................................................................... ix
List of Annexes ....................................................................................................................... x
List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................................... xi

## Chapter One Introduction: ............................................................................................. 1

1.1 Background: ..................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Problem statement: .......................................................................................................... 2
1.3 Justification ...................................................................................................................... 3
1.4 Aim .................................................................................................................................. 4
1.5 Objectives ........................................................................................................................ 4
1.6 Questions .......................................................................................................................... 4
1.7 Context ............................................................................................................................... 5
  1.7.1 Demographic context ................................................................................................. 5
  1.7.2 Socioeconomic characteristic .................................................................................. 5
  1.7.3 Health care system .................................................................................................... 6
  1.7.4 Palestinian Medical Schools ................................................................................... 7
  1.7.5 Undergraduate medical programs .......................................................................... 7
  1.7.6 Postgraduate education ........................................................................................... 7
1.8 Licensing procedures and continuing medical education .............................................. 8
1.9 The Directorate General of human resources development .......................................... 8
1.10 Medical internship program in Gaza ........................................................................... 9
1.11 Educational hospitals ..................................................................................................... 9
1.12 Definition of terms ........................................................................................................ 10
### 1.12.1 Medical Internship (MI) ................................................................. 10
### 1.12.2 Evaluation ..................................................................................... 10

**Chapter Two Literature Review & Conceptual Frame Work .......................... 11**

2.1 Conceptual framework ........................................................................... 11
  2.1.1 Input factors: .................................................................................... 12
  2.1.2 Process factors: ................................................................................ 12
  2.1.3 Output factors: ................................................................................ 13
  2.1.4 Evaluation: ....................................................................................... 13
  2.1.5 Purpose of evaluation ........................................................................ 14
2.2 Literature review ...................................................................................... 15
  2.2.1 Introduction: ..................................................................................... 15
  2.2.2 The importance of the medical internship program: ......................... 15
2.3 Structure of the medical internship years globally .................................... 16
2.4 Structure of the medical internship years some neighboring countries ....... 17
2.5 Structure of the medical internship years in Gaza .................................... 18
2.6 Evaluation of the medical internship program globally ............................. 18
2.7 Evaluation of the medical internship program regionally .......................... 24
2.8 The role of General Directorate of human resources development (GDHRD) in the training program (Management of the medical internship program) ............. 25
2.9 The design of the medical internship program ........................................... 26
2.10 The content of the medical internship program ........................................ 28
2.11 The environment of the medical internship program ................................ 30
2.12 The effect of the medical internship program ........................................... 32
2.13 Summary .............................................................................................. 35

**Chapter Three Methodology ....................................................................... 36**

3.1 Study design ........................................................................................... 36
3.2 Study Population ..................................................................................... 37
  3.2.1 Quantitative Part ............................................................................... 37
  3.2.2 Qualitative part ................................................................................ 37
3.3 Eligibility criteria .................................................................................... 37
  3.3.1 Inclusion criteria .............................................................................. 37
  3.3.2 Exclusion criteria ............................................................................. 37
3.4 Study setting ........................................................................................................38
3.5 Study period .........................................................................................................38
3.6 Study instruments ...............................................................................................38
3.7 Ethical considerations ........................................................................................40
3.8 Pilot study ............................................................................................................40
  3.8.1 Quantitative Part ............................................................................................40
  3.8.2 Qualitative Part .............................................................................................41
3.9 Data collection ....................................................................................................41
  3.9.1 Quantitative data ...........................................................................................41
  3.9.2 Qualitative data ............................................................................................41
3.10 Scientific rigor ..................................................................................................42
  3.10.1 Quantitative part (questionnaire) ...............................................................42
  3.10.2 Qualitative part ..........................................................................................44
3.11 Data entry and analysis .....................................................................................44
  3.11.1 Quantitative part .........................................................................................44
  3.11.2 Qualitative part ..........................................................................................45
3.12 Limitations of the study ....................................................................................45

Chapter 4 Results and Discussion .........................................................................46
4.1 Introduction .........................................................................................................46
4.2 Descriptive statistics ...........................................................................................46
  4.2.1 Demographic characteristics of the respondents ..........................................46
  4.2.2 Educational qualifications for the respondents ..............................................50
  4.2.3 The role of the General Directorate of Human Resource Development (GDHRD) in the training program .......................................................52
  4.2.4 The design of the medical internship program ..............................................57
  4.2.5 The content of the medical internship program ............................................61
  4.2.6 The environment of the medical internship program ....................................66
  4.2.7 Effect of the medical internship program ....................................................72
  4.2.8 The overall mean of the respondent about the study domain ......................78
4.3 Inferential Statistics .............................................................................................79
  4.3.1 Difference between study domains and socio-demographic variables ..........79
  4.3.2 Differences between study domains and age .................................................81
  4.3.3 Differences between study domains and gender ..........................................82
  4.3.4 Differences between study domains and marital status ...............................83
4.3.5 Differences between study domains and if there is another physician in the family member ................................................................. 83
4.3.6 Differences between study domains and refugee status .................. 84
4.3.7 Differences between study domains and educational level ................. 85
4.3.8 Differences between study domains and year of graduation from university 85
4.3.9 Differences between study domains and place of graduation ................. 86
4.4 How the participants who spent part of the internship program outside the Gaza Strip evaluate the local internship program .............................................. 88
4.5 Participants perception about the quality of rotations and training centers .... 89
4.6 Qualitative analysis of the medical internship program ......................... 91
  4.6.1 The major perceived points of strength in the medical internship program were highlighted by the participants .................................................. 91
  4.6.2 The major perceived points of weakness in the medical internship program were highlighted by the participants .................................................. 91
  4.6.3 The major Perceived opportunity/opportunities for improvement at the intern program were highlighted by the participants ......................... 92
  4.6.4 The major challenges facing the medical internship program were highlighted by the participants ................................................................. 92
  4.6.5 Suggestions proposed to make a positive change in the medical internship program were highlighted by the participants ......................................... 93
  4.6.6 The most important skill acquired during the medical internship program was highlighted by the participants .................................................. 93
  4.6.7 The most important suggestions proposed to make development in the performance of the medical internship program were highlighted by the participants ................................................................. 94

Chapter Five Conclusion and Recommendation ........................................... 95
  5.1 Conclusion.......................................................................................... 95
  5.2 Recommendations................................................................................. 97
  5.3 Recommendation for a new area of research ........................................ 98

References................................................................................................... 99

Annexes..................................................................................................... 107
List of tables

Table (3.1): Validity of the instrument ................................................................. 43
Table (3.2): Reliability estimates for domains and the entire scale ...................... 44
Table (4.1): Distribution of study respondents by demographic data (characteristics) .... 47
Table (4.2): Distribution of study respondents according to their education ............ 50
Table (4.3): Total mean respondents about the role of GDHRD regarding the training process ........................................................................................................... 52
Table (4.4): Total mean respondents about the design of the medical internship program ...................................................................................................................... 57
Table (4.5): Total mean respondents about the content of the medical internship program ...................................................................................................................... 61
Table (4.6): Total mean respondent about the environment of the medical internship program (in the training centers) ........................................................................... 66
Table (4.7) Total mean respondent about the effect of the medical internship program .... 72
Table (4.8): Total mean of respondent perception about the domains studied .......... 78
Table (4.9): Differences between study domains and governorates .......................... 79
Table (4.10): Differences between study domains and age ..................................... 81
Table (4.11): Differences between study domains and gender .................................. 82
Table (4.12): Differences between study domains and marital status ..................... 83
Table (4.13): Relationship between the study domains and the presence or absence of other physicians in the family .......................................................................................... 83
Table (4.14): Differences between study domains and refugee status ..................... 84
Table (4.15): Differences between study domains and education level .................... 85
Table (4.16): Differences between study domains and year of graduation from university ................................................................................................................................. 85
Table (4.17): Differences between study domains and place of graduation .............. 86
Table (4.18): Distribution of the study participants according received part of the internship program outside the Gaza Strip ................................................................. 88
Table (4.19): Distribution of the study respondent according to their responses about best or worst rotations, and training centers ............................................................... 89
List of Figures

Figure (2.1): Conceptual Framework................................................................. 11
Figure (4.1): Distribution of the study participants according to their age ............ 48
Figure (4.2): Distribution of the study participants according to their gender............ 48
Figure (4.3): Distribution of the study participants according to their residence........ 49
Figure (4.4): Total mean of respondent perception about the domains studied .......... 78
List of Annexes

Annex (1): Palestine Map ................................................................. 107
Annex (2): Distribution of Gaza Strip Governorates ............................ 108
Annex (3): Trend showed the Increasing number of intern doctors from 2012 until 2019. ................................................................. 109
Annex (4): the study instrument Arabic ........................................... 110
Annex (5): the study instrument in English ....................................... 116
Annex (6): Focus group for intern doctors ....................................... 122
Annex (7): KII questions ................................................................. 123
Annex (8): KII participants ............................................................. 124
Annex (9): An official letter of approval from Helsinki Committee in the Gaza Strip .... 125
Annex (10): Universities Approval .................................................... 126
Annex (11): Administrative Approval ............................................... 127
Annex (12): List of arbitrators .......................................................... 128
Annex (13): Arabic translation for the Abstract .................................. 129
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACFJD</td>
<td>The Australian curriculum framework for junior doctors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANOVA</td>
<td>One-way Analysis of Variance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSc</td>
<td>Bachelor of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDHRD</td>
<td>General directorate of human resource development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GS</td>
<td>Gaza Strip</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMC</td>
<td>Hamad Medical Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Km</td>
<td>Kilometer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA</td>
<td>Medical Board of Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCNZ</td>
<td>Medical Council of New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
<td>Median</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MI</td>
<td>Medical Internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOH</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBME</td>
<td>National board of medical exam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIS</td>
<td>New Israeli Shekel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Objective structured clinical exam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Palestinian Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCBS</td>
<td>Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGY 1</td>
<td>first postgraduate year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGY 2</td>
<td>Second postgraduate year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHC</td>
<td>Primary Health Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMC</td>
<td>Palestine Medical Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRHO</td>
<td>Pre-registration house office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRINT</td>
<td>Preparation for Internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sd</td>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>Statistical Package for Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sq.</td>
<td>Square</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>