

Deanship of Graduate Studies

Al-Quds University



**Quality of Healthcare Documentation at UNRWA health
Centers in the Gaza Governorates**

Mohammed M. Alkhaldi

MPH Thesis

Jerusalem- Palestine

1438 / 2017

Quality of Healthcare Documentation at UNRWA health Centers in the Gaza Governorates

Prepared By

Mohammed Munir Alkhalidi

Bachelor degree in Medicine and General Surgery –
University of Mosul – Iraq

Supervisor: Dr. Bassam Abu Hamad
PhD, Associate Professor- School of Public Health

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of Requirements
for the Degree of Master of Public Health /Health
management- Al-Quds University

1438 / 2017

Al-Quds University
Deanship of Graduate Studies
School of Public Health



Thesis Approval




Quality of Healthcare Documentation at UNRWA Health Centers in the Gaza Governorates

Prepared By: Mohammed Munir AlKhalidi
Registration No.: 21411269

Supervisor: Dr. Bassam Abu Hamad

Master thesis submitted and accepted. Date: / /

The names and signatures of the examining committee members are as follow:

1. Head of committee:	Dr. Bassam Abu Hamad	Signature 
2. Internal examiner:	Dr. Yehia Abed	Signature 
3. External examiner:	Dr. Ghada Aljadba	Signature 

Jerusalem – Palestine

1438 / 2017

Dedication

To the person who taught me that knowledge is power. The man
who supported me and encouraged me to believe in myself

My father

To the strong and gentle soul who offered me everything to make
me be who I am today

My mother

To the wonderful person who gave me the support and affections all
the way

My wife

To the real treasure in my life, Munir, Rkan and Ryan

My sons

To those who have been an inspiration to me

My teachers

I dedicate this thesis for all of them

Declaration

I certify that this thesis submitted for the degree of Master, is the result of my own research, except where otherwise acknowledged, and this study (or any part of the same) has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

Signed:

Mohammed M. Alkhalidi

..... / /

Dedication

To the person who taught me that knowledge is power. The man who supported me and encouraged me to believe in myself

My father

To the strong and gentle soul who offered me everything to make me be who I am today

My mother

To the wonderful person who gave me the support and affections all the way

My wife

To the real treasure in my life, Munir, Rkan and Ryan

My sons

To those who have been an inspiration to me

My teachers

I dedicate this thesis for all of them

Declaration

I certify that this thesis submitted for the degree of Master, is the result of my own research, except where otherwise acknowledged, and this study (or any part of the same) has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution.

Signed:

Mohammed M. Alkhaldi

..... / /

Acknowledgement

First and foremost, I must acknowledge my limitless thanks and gratitude to my supervisor **Dr. Bassam Abu Hamad**, for everything he did and is doing; particularly for his friendly tutorship, patience, supervision, transferable experience and unforgettable endless professional support.

Deep thanks are extended to **Dr. Ghada AlJadba**, the chief health director in UNRWA health program for her endless support and encouragement for the research in general and for me in particular. Appreciation is extended also to the area health officers and senior medical officers for supporting me in data collection. I highly appreciate the efforts expended by **Dr. Kefah AlNajjar** and **Mr. Mahmoud AlKhlout**, for their participation in reviewing the study tools, for their help in data collection, and for being interviewees in the quality part of my study. In addition, my utmost regards must also go to the panel of experts who reviewed the study tools and provided lucrative feedback.

I would like to take this opportunity to extend thanks to all my beloved friends, who have been so supportive along the way of doing my thesis, namely **Dr. Tamer AlShaer** and **Dr. Mohammed Ubaid**. I am grateful to all my colleagues at UNRWA health centers, especially my colleagues at Beach health center led by **Dr. Nevin AlTelbani** and **Dr. Kmal Hammo**, who helped me in collecting the required data, and provide me valuable input to conduct this study.

I also would like to express my sincere thanks to my family for their generous support they provided me throughout my entire life and particularly through the process of pursuing the master degree. Because of their unconditional love and prayers, I have the chance to complete this thesis.

I owe a deep debt of gratitude to Al-Quds University for giving me the opportunity to do this master study.

Last but not least, deepest thanks go to all people who took part in making this thesis real.

With sincere respect
Mohammed Alkhaldi

Abstract

Information play a vital role in health and the medical record is an important medium for providing information for the health staff, decision makers and researchers. This study aims to ascertain the quality of healthcare documentation at UNRWA health centers in the Gaza Strip, in order to enhance the quality of care which optimally contributes to better health outcomes.

A mixed-methods approach was used, in which data have been triangulated. In total, 204 randomly selected (systematic sampling approach) healthcare providers participated in the quantitative part of the study with 96% response rate and 408 patient records were reviewed. In addition, seven in-depth interviews were conducted with purposively selected key informants. Quantitative data were collected through group-administered questionnaire and then records were reviewed. The preliminary findings derived from the quantitative part informed the qualitative data collection. The overall reliability was high (Cronbach's Alpha 0.890). The Statistical Package for Social Sciences software was used for the quantitative data entry and analysis while the Open Coding Thematic technique was used to analyze the qualitative data.

Results showed that 35% of participants were males, 65% females. About half of them were nurses, one third were doctors and the rest were midwives. One third of the participants received on-the-job training about documentation. The overall quality of healthcare documentation has elicited score of 77%. Healthcare providers' perspectives had the highest score (81%), followed by documentation practicalities (78%), then knowledge and managerial factors (74%) each. Barriers to healthcare documentation scored 72%, with work overload, shortage of staff and lack of training were perceived as the main barriers for healthcare documentation.

Findings from the records review revealed that the overall availability and completeness of available parameters were 74% and 80% respectively. A real gap was found in the Non-Communicable Diseases records; the availability and completeness were 74% and 53% respectively. In addition, the patient complaints, physical examination findings and management plan availability in the general health records were low.

Inferential statistics show that males, younger, doctors, Bachelor degree holders and graduates of Arab countries elicited less quality scores and more documentation errors than their counterpart from other groups.

Results of the qualitative study were supportive to what was found in the quantitative component. Interestingly, key informants consider the change of documentation from the paper-based to the electronic based documentation system is one of the greatest achievements of the health department during the last decade. Qualitative findings emphasized the importance of supervision and training to improve the quality of documentation.

The study concluded that the quality of healthcare documentation at UNRWA health centers is reasonable, but still it requires further improvement with greater emphasis on training, supervision and further development of the electronic information system.

Table of contents

- Dedication.....i
- Declarationii
- Acknowledgement.....iii
- Abstractiv
- List of tablesix
- List of Annexes.....x
- List of Figuresxi
- LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....xii
- Chapter I: Introduction 1**
 - 1.1 Background..... 1**
 - 1.2 Research problem.....3**
 - 1.3 Aim of the study4**
 - 1.4 Study objectives4**
 - 1.5 Study questions4**
 - 1.6 Context of the study.....5**
 - 1.6.1 Geographical and political context5
 - 1.6.2 Demographic context5
 - 1.6.3 Socioeconomic context6
 - 1.6.4 Health context and healthcare system7
 - 1.6.5 UNRWA.....9
 - 1.7 Operational definitions 10**
 - 1.8 Study layout 12**

Chapter II: Conceptual framework and literature review	14
2.1 Conceptual framework	14
2.1.1 Dependent variables	15
2.1.2 Independent variables	16
2.2 Literature review	17
2.2.1 History of healthcare documentation	17
2.2.2 Definition of healthcare documentation.....	18
2.2.3 General status of healthcare documentation	18
2.2.4 Values of medical records	19
2.2.5 Methods of documentation.....	21
2.2.6 Paper-based versus EMR	23
2.2.7 Documentation standards and contents of medical record.....	25
2.2.8 Medical record best practice and its measurement	26
2.2.9 Barriers to quality healthcare documentation	28
2.2.10 Management factors affecting healthcare documentation	29
2.2.11 Common mistakes in documentation	32
Chapter III: Methodology	34
3.1 Study design	34
3.2 Study setting.....	34
3.3 Study population.....	35
3.4 Study period	35
3.5 Eligibility criteria.....	36
3.6 Sampling process and calculation	37
3.7 Ethical and administrative considerations.....	38
3.8 Study instruments.....	39
3.9 Pilot study	40
3.10 Data collection.....	40

3.11 Response rate	42
3.12 Scientific rigor.....	42
3.13 Data entry and analysis.....	44
3.14 Study limitations.....	44
Chapter IV: Results and discussion.....	46
4.1 Findings derived from the surveyed questionnaire.....	46
4.1.1 Descriptive statistics.....	46
4.1.1.1 Demographic characteristics.....	46
4.1.1.2 Work related characteristics	49
4.1.1.3 Participants’ knowledge about healthcare documentation.....	52
4.1.1.4 Participants’ perspectives about healthcare documentation	55
4.1.1.5 Healthcare documentation practicalities.....	59
4.1.1.6 Managerial factors affecting healthcare documentation.....	62
4.1.1.7 Errors of healthcare documentation.....	67
4.1.1.8 Barriers for documentation practices.....	68
4.1.1.9 The overall quality of healthcare documentation:	71
4.1.1.10 Level of satisfaction about documentation at UNRWA health centers	72
4.1.2 Inferential analysis of the findings of the surveyed questionnaire	72
4.1.2.1 Differences in quality of documentation in reference to demographic characteristics.....	73
4.1.2.2 Differences in quality of documentation in reference to work related characteristics	75
4.1.2.3 Differences in errors of documentation in reference to participants’ characteristics	77
4.1.2.4 Differences in barriers in reference to demographic and work related characteristics.....	79
4.1.2.5 Satisfaction of healthcare providers with current documentation practices	79
4.2 Findings derived from the record review	80
4.2.1 Descriptive statistics.....	80
4.2.1.1 General outpatient records.....	80
4.2.1.2 Child health records.....	82
4.2.1.3 Maternal health records	83
4.2.1.4 NCD records.....	84
4.2.1.5 Overall availability and completeness of the reviewed records	85

4.2.2 Inferential statistic	86
Chapter V: Conclusion and recommendations.....	88
5.1 Conclusion.....	88
5.2 Recommendations.....	92
5.3 Recommendations for further research	93
References.....	94
Annexes.....	107
Summaryin Arabic	130

List of tables

No.	Title	page
Table 3.1:	Result of Cronbach's alpha test	43
Table 4.1:	Distribution of respondents by demographic characteristics	47
Table 4.2:	Distribution of responses by work related characteristics	49
Table 4.3:	Distribution of responses by Participants' knowledge about documentation	52
Table 4.4:	Distribution of responses regarding the knowledge of quality characteristics of healthcare documentation	54
Table 4.5:	Distribution of responses by participants' perceptions about documentation	56
Table 4.6:	Distribution of responses regarding the documentation realities	60
Table 4.7:	Distribution of responses according to managerial factors affecting healthcare documentation	63
Table 4.8:	Distribution of responses according to encountered errors	70
Table 4.9:	Distribution of responses according to barriers of documentation	72
Table 4.10:	Differences in documentation in reference to demographic characteristics	76
Table 4.11:	Differences in documentation in reference to work related characteristics	78
Table 4.12:	Differences in encountered errors of documentation in reference to participants' characteristics	81
Table 4.13:	Satisfaction of health care provider with current documentation practices	82
Table 4.14:	Distribution of medical records by availability and completeness	84
Table 4.15:	Differences in medical records availability and completeness in relation to level of health center and documentation system	89

List of Annexes

No.	Title	Page
Annex 1:	Distribution of the UNRWA health centers across the Gaza Strip	110
Annex 2:	List of Arbitrators	111
Annex 3:	Healthcare providers sample size calculation	112
Annex 4:	Medical records sample size calculation	112
Annex 5:	List of key informants	110
Annex 6:	Official letter of approval from UNRWA health department administration	113
Annex 7:	Official letter of approval from the Helsinki committee in the Gaza Strip	114
Annex 8:	Healthcare provider questionnaire	115
Annex 9:	Abstraction forms	122
Annex 10:	Key informant interview schedule	124
Annex 11:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in documentation quality among different professions	126
Annex 12:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in documentation quality among different educational levels	126
Annex 13:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in documentation quality among different work stations	127
Annex 14:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in documentation quality among different training durations	128
Annex 15:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in the faced errors of documentation among different professions	128
Annex 16:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in the faced errors among different work stations	129
Annex 17:	Differences in barriers to documentation in reference to demographic and work related characteristics	130
Annex 18:	LSD post hoc test: Differences in the availability and completeness of the parameters in the medical records among different systems	131